

THE TEXAS TAXPAYER & STUDENT	§	IN THE DISTRICT COURT
FAIRNESS COALITION;	§	
HILLSBORO I.S.D., HUTTO I.S.D. ,	§	
NACOGDOCHES I.S.D.	§	
PFLUGERVILLE I.S.D.	§	
SAN ANTONIO I.S.D., TAYLOR I.S.D.	§	
VAN I.S.D.; RANDY PITTTENGER;	§	
CHIP LANGSTON; and SHELBY	§	
DAVIDSON, as next friend of	§	200TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT
CORTLAND, CARLI and CASI	§	
DAVIDSON,	§	
Plaintiffs,	§	
	§	
vs.	§	
	§	
ROBERT SCOTT, COMMISSIONER	§	
OF EDUCATION, IN HIS OFFICIAL	§	
CAPACITY; SUSAN COMBS, TEXAS	§	
COMPTROLLER OF PUBLIC	§	
ACCOUNTS, IN HER OFFICIAL	§	
CAPACITY; and TEXAS STATE BOARD	§	
OF EDUCATION,	§	
	§	
Defendants.	§	TRAVIS COUNTY, TEXAS

DEFENDANTS’ ORIGINAL ANSWER

TO THE HONORABLE JUDGE OF SAID COURT:

Defendants, Robert Scott, Commissioner of Education in his official capacity, Susan Combs, Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts in her official capacity and the Texas State Board of Education file their Original Answer in response to Plaintiffs’ Original Petition and Request for Declaratory Relief.

I INTRODUCTION

The Texas Constitution provides

A general diffusion of knowledge being essential to the preservation of liberties and rights of the people, it shall be the duty of the Legislature of the State to establish and make suitable provision for the support and maintenance of an efficient system of public free schools.

TEX. CONST., Art. VII, § 1.

The Texas Supreme Court, interpreting this provision, has established that a constitutionally adequate system, which provides a general diffusion of knowledge, is the floor upon which all claims under Article VII, §1 claims must rest. *Edgewood Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Meno*, 917 S.W.3d 717, 731 (Tex. 1995) (“*Edgewood IV*”); see *West Orange-Cove Consolidated Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Neeley*, 176 S.W.3d 746, 790, 792, 795, 798 (Tex. 2005) (“*West Orange-Cove II*”). To state an actionable claim under *Edgewood IV* or *West Orange-Cove II*, Plaintiffs must not only demonstrate their standing to do so, but also prove that with current levels of funding and at previously-imposed tax efforts, the districts are “not reasonably able to afford all students access to education and the education opportunity to accomplish a general diffusion of knowledge.” *West Orange-Cove II*, 176 S.W.3d at 789-90. Plaintiffs have generally failed to plead a claim under *West Orange-Cove II*.

II GENERAL DENIAL

Defendants, Robert Scott, Commissioner of Education in his official capacity, Susan Combs, Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts in her official capacity and the Texas State Board of Education generally deny each and every allegation in Plaintiffs’ Original Petition and demand strict proof thereof by a preponderance of credible evidence.

**III
PRAYER**

Defendants request Plaintiffs take nothing by this action. Defendants further respectfully request the Court award to them any relief to which they are entitled, including costs of suit and attorney's fees.

Respectfully submitted,

GREG ABBOTT
Attorney General of Texas

DANIEL T. HODGE
First Assistant Attorney General

BILL COBB
Deputy Attorney General for Civil Litigation

DAVID C. MATTAX
Director of Defense Litigation

ROBERT B. O'KEEFE
Chief, General Litigation Division

/s/ SHELLEY N. DAHLBERG
SHELLEY N. DAHLBERG
Assistant Attorney General
Texas Bar No. 24012491
JAMES "BEAU" ECCLES
Assistant Attorney General
Deputy Chief – General Litigation Division
Texas Bar No. 00793668
ERIKA KANE
Assistant Attorney General
Texas Bar No. 24050850
Texas Attorney General's Office
General Litigation Division
P. O. Box 12548, Capitol Station
Austin, Texas 78711
Phone: (512) 936-1534/Fax: (512) 320-0667

Attorneys for Defendants

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify a true and correct copy of the foregoing document has been sent by electronic transmission, facsimile or First Class Mail on November 7, 2011 to the following:

Richard E. Gray, III
Toni Hunter
GRAY & BECKER
900 West Ave.
Austin, TX 78701

Randall B. Wood
Doug W. Ray
RAY & WOOD
2700 Bee Caves Rd. #200
Austin, TX 78746

/s/ SHELLEY N. DAHLBERG
SHELLEY N. DALHBERG
Assistant Attorney General